

Best Paper Awards for TOCHI

KEN HINCKLEY, Editor-in-Chief

The following document hereby serves as public notice of the formation of the **ACM Transactions on Computer-Human Interaction Best Paper Award**, as well as the rules governing the process.

1. INTRODUCTION

This proposal contains the full details of all procedures governing the annual TOCHI Best Paper award(s), including the purpose of the award, nominations, rules for forming the selection committee, and the selection process itself (including the handling of conflicts-of-interest). The proposal was approved in December of 2015 by the ACM Publications Board.

I would like to thank the board, and particularly ACM Director of Publications Bernard Rous, for working with me on ironing out numerous aspects of the proposal.

2. FORMAL PROPOSAL AND RULES GOVERNING TOCHI BEST PAPER AWARDS

As the Editor-in-Chief of ACM Transactions on Computer-Human Interaction, I would like to move forward with Best Paper Awards for the journal starting in calendar year 2016 (i.e. with TOCHI volume 23). Please see the details of our proposal for this award below.

(1) **Award Name:** ACM Transactions on Computer-Human Interaction 2016 Best Paper Award. (And for 2017, 2018, ...)

— These awards will be given out annually, starting with papers published in 2016 (i.e. TOCHI Volume 23, Issue 1). Papers published earlier will not be eligible.

— **Purpose of award:** The purpose of the award is to recognize and bring greater attention to the excellence of top papers published in TOCHI. This helps build the careers of our authors as well as the stature and desirability of publication in the TOCHI journal itself. This further affords carry-over benefits to publicity, downloads, and citations to the journal, thereby enhancing the influence of the award winners as well as the impact factor all of the excellent papers that we publish.

— **Criteria for Selection:** Overall merit of the work. See detailed criteria below.

(2) **Nominations** will be solicited from the following sources:

— Upon final acceptance, all papers are automatically considered as potential Best Paper nominees. As part of the Editor-in-Chief's normal due diligence activities, he or she reads all TOCHI acceptances in detail, and will correspond with the Associate Editor who handled the paper regarding possible Best Paper nomination for work with outstanding contributions.

— The Associate Editor who handles a paper may independently nominate it for Best Paper as part of his or her normal reviewing activity for the manuscript.

— As well, members of the TOCHI Editorial Board can nominate any paper published in TOCHI, whether they were involved with the manuscript or not.

— Any individual can nominate or self-nominate an eligible TOCHI paper for any reason by writing to tochi@acm.org, by contacting the Editor-in-Chief, or by tweeting

to @acmtochi. A brief statement of why the paper should be considered for an award is appreciated but not required.

- Nominations will additionally be solicited from the following:
 - A message to the TOCHI editors' private mailing list reminding them to nominate outstanding papers that they have handled.
 - A public call for nominations posted to the TOCHI news page (blog): <http://tochi.acm.org/news/>
 - A public call for nominations shared on at least 3 occasions on the TOCHI twitter feed (@acmtochi)

(3) Selection Process and Criteria.

- **Selection Process:** The Editor-in-Chief, acting as Chair and in cooperation with the Selection Committee, will winnow down candidates based on our careful reading of the manuscripts and discussion of each paper's merits. Final candidates will be voted on with a yes / no consensus. Each member of the Selection Committee has equal voting rights, but the Chair will hold the final discretion in case of impasse. All deliberations shall be confidential, and all decisions final.
- **How Conflicts of Interest Will Be Handled:** If a member of the Selection Committee has any conflict with a nominated paper, they must abstain from all discussion or voting on that paper. Papers authored by the Editor-in-Chief are not eligible for the award during his or her tenure, but in case of other conflicts, the Editorial Board's delegate for handling EiC conflicts (currently Rob Jacob) will assume the role of Committee Chair during any deliberations involving that paper.
- **Criteria:** The criteria for the award is overall merit of the work, in terms of technical excellence, significance to the research community, impact, clarity of presentation, and scope of the contribution (among other criteria of outstanding research).
 - The paper's eligibility will be based on the date of the TOCHI Issue that it appears in, i.e. all papers in TOCHI Volume 23, Issue 1 (February 2016) through Issue 6 (December 2016) will be eligible for the 2016 award (regardless of when they first appear electronically in the ACM Digital Library).
 - At least one paper will be recognized for each year's Best Paper Award.
 - The number of additional awards made each year is at the discretion of the Selection Committee, but no more than 6% of the eligible pool (rounding to the nearest whole integer) may be recognized.

(4) Form of the Award. The physical manifestation of the award will be a certificate or plaque (TBD).

- All listed authors on awarded manuscripts will receive an award; certificates may be the preferred form of the award in cases of manuscripts with a large number of authors.
- A list of all awarded papers will also be maintained and archived on the TOCHI web site. This list shall include the name of the award including the calendar year, the full names of all authors, the paper title, and a link to the ACM Digital Library authoritative version of the paper.
- There will be **no** monetary prize associated with the award.

- (5) **Frequency of the Award.** Annual, starting in 2016. The Best Paper Award(s) will be given out once per calendar year. The award winner(s) will be announced in the first issue of the new year, which normally publishes in February, so the 2016 Award(s) will be announced in Feb. 2017 (Vol. 24, Issue 1).
- (6) **Selection Committee.** The Selection Committee will be chaired by the Editor-in-Chief, and will consist of a number of senior and very active members of the TOCHI Editorial Board with diverse expertise and interests. The Selection Committee shall be appointed by the Editor-in-Chief and consist of at least three, and no more than seven, voting members. Only active members of the TOCHI Editorial Board, who have served at least one calendar year as an Associate Editor in good standing, are eligible for the Selection Committee. However, confidential consultation with non-voting external experts, e.g. for advice on specific technical issues, is allowed. The chair is responsible to ensure that the process is fair and unbiased, that the deliberations remain confidential, and that all conflicts of interest are identified and handled appropriately.
- The rules for forming this Selection Committee will be documented and publicly available on TOCHI's Web Page by January 2016 (at <http://tochi.acm.org/awards>). The establishment of the award will also be announced in my introductory Editorial (see Issue 23:1, "Editorial: Welcome to a New Era for TOCHI").
 - Membership of the Selection Committee is expected to change year-to-year depending on the editors' availability and other commitments.
 - In recognition that it is vital to maintain a consistent schedule of awards — and that failure to give out an award in a given calendar year could reflect poorly on the journal and its authors — members of the Selection Committee shall commit to make at least one Best Paper Award per calendar year, even if that means they must abstain from voting on particular paper(s) to make this possible.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I would like to thank the board, and particularly ACM Director of Publications Bernard Rous, for working with me on ironing out numerous aspects of the proposal.

Ken Hinckley
Editor-in-Chief

*Redmond, Washington
January 12, 2016*